```
NO. CC 096 204518 04
 1
    GAMAL ABDEL-HAFIZ,
                                 IN THE DISTRICT COURT
                              )
 2
   VS.
 3
   FOX ENTERTAINMENT GROUP,
                              ) TARRANT COUNTY, TEXAS
   INC., FOX BROADCASTING
   COMPANY, FOX NEWS, INC., FOX)
   NEWS NETWORK, INC., FOX NEWS)
   NETWORK, L.L.C., FOX NEWS
   HOLDINGS, INC., AND BILL
   O'REILLY,
                              )
                                 96th JUDICIAL DISTRICT
 7
   ******************
                   ORAL DEPOSITION OF
                      MARK FLESSNER
                    February 21, 2006
 9
                        Volume 1
   *************
10
11
        ORAL DEPOSITION OF MARK FLESSNER, produced as a
12
   witness at the instance of the Defendant, and duly
13
   sworn, was taken in the above-styled and numbered
14
   cause on the 21st day of February, 2006, from 1:07
15
   p.m. to 3:16 p.m., before NICOLE M. DeBARTOLO,
16
   Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for the State of
17
   Illinois, reported by Stenograph Machine, at the
18
   office of Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal, 8000 Sears
19
   Tower, 233 South Wacker Drive, Chicago, Illinois,
20
   60606, pursuant to the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure
21
   and the provisions stated on the record or attached
22
   hereto.
23
24
```

	Pages 1 to
Pac	ge 1 Page 3
NO. CC 096 204518 04	1 DEPOSITION OF
GAMAL ABDEL-HAFIZ, ) IN THE DISTRICT CO	WARR PLESSNER
vs.	2 taken February 21, 2006 3 EXAMINATION BY PAGE
FOX ENTERTAINMENT GROUP, TARRANT COUNTY, TE	
INC., FOX BROADCASTING ) COMPANY, FOX NEWS, INC., FOX)	4 Mr. Kaitcer 48
NEWS NETWORK, INC., FOX NEWS) NETWORK, L.L.C., FOX NEWS )	5 EXHIBITS
HOLDINGS, INC., AND BILL ) O'REILLY, ) 96th JUDICIAL DIST	PAGE
7 John Copielli Biol	7 Exhibit No. 11A 31 Exhibit No. 40 42
ORAL DEPOSITION OF	8 Exhibit No. 41 66
MARK FLESSNER February 21, 2006	Exhibit No. 42 26
Volume 1	9 Exhibit No. 47 11 Exhibit No. 48 11
ORAL DEPOSITION OF MARK FLESSNER, produced a witness at the instance of the Defendant, and dul	s a 10Exhibit No. 49 28
sworn, was taken in the above-styled and numbered	EXHIBIT NO. 50 46
cause on the 21st day of February, 2006, from 1:0 p.m. to 3:16 p.m., before NICOLE M. DeBARTOLO,	12
Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for the State Illinois, reported by Stenograph Machine, at the	13
office of Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal, 8000 Sea Tower, 233 South Wacker Drive, Chicago, Illinois,	
60606, pursuant to the Texas Rules of Civil Proce and the provisions stated on the record or attach	dure 16
hereto.	ed   17
	19
	20 21
	22
	23 24
Pag	Page 4
1 APPEARANCES 2 FOR THE PLAINTIFF:	1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Here begins Tape No. 1 in the
MR. JEFFREY N. KAITCER (via telephone)	2 videotaped deposition of Mark Flessner in the matter
3 LOE, WARREN, ROSENFIELD, KAITCER & HIBBS, P.C. 4420 West Vickery Boulevard	3 of Gamal Abdel-Hafiz versus Fox Entertainment Group,
4 P.O. Box 100609 Fort Worth, Texas 76185-0609	4 Inc., et al. in the District Court, Tarrant County, 5 Texas, 96th Judicial District, Cause No. 096 2045 18
5 FOR THE DEFENDANTS:	6 04.
6 MR. CHARLES L. BABCOCK (via telephone)	7 This deposition is being held at 233 South
JACKSON WALKER, L.L.P. 7 901 Main Street	8 Wacker, Chicago, Illinois on February 21st, 2006 at
Suite 6000 8 Dallas, Texas 75202	9 approximately 1:09.
9 FOR JOHN VINCENT AND ROBERT WRIGHT: MR. TODD HUTTON (via telephone)	10 My name is Walter Cwik, and I'm a certified
10JUDICIAL WATCH, INC.	11legal video specialist from the firm of Legalink.
5735 Pineland Drive 11Suite 275	12The court reporter today is Nicole DeBartolo in
Dallas, Texas 75231	13 association with Legalink.
FOR THE WITNESS:	Will counsel please introduce themselves for 15the record.
13MR. JOHN S. KOSKI SONNENSCHEIN NATH & ROSENTHAL	15 the record.  16 MR. KAITCER: My name is Jeff Kaitcer. I
148000 Sears Tower 233 South Wacker Drive	17 represent the plaintiff Gamal Abdel-Hafiz.
15Chicago, Illinois 60606 16ALSO PRESENT: Mr. Gamal Abdel-Hafiz (via telephone)	18 MR. BABCOCK: And this is Charles Babcock of the
Mr. John Vincent	19law firm of Jackson Walker representing all of the
17 18	20 defendants with the exception of Mr. Vincent and
19   20	21Mr. Wright.
21	22 MR. HUTTON: This is Todd Hutton in Dallas. I
22   23	23represent Mr. Vincent and Mr. Wright, and we are
24	24 observing and monitoring these proceedings subject to

1 our challenge to the Texas jurisdiction in this 2 matter.

- 3 MR. KOSKI: And this is John Koski of the firm of 4 Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal, LLP. I'm counsel for 5 the witness.
- 6 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Will the court reporter please 7 swear in the witness.
- 8 MARK A. FLESSNER.

9 called as a witness herein, having been first duly 10sworn, was examined upon oral interrogatories and 11testified as follows:

12 EXAMINATION

13BY MR. BABCOCK:

- 14 Q Would you state your name, sir?
- 15 A My name is Mark Flessner.
- 16 Q Mr. Flessner, how are you employed?
- 17 A Who is asking questions?
- 18 Q I'm sorry. This is Chip Babcock asking 19questions.
- 20 A I am a partner in the law firm of
- 21 Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal, LLP.
- 22 Q And how long have you been a partner in that 23law firm?
- 24 A Not quite three years.

Page 7

1 firm in Chicago for about ten months, maybe not even 2 ten months, about eight months. I can't remember the 3 name of it because it was the labor department of

4 Schiff Hardin & Waite, and they ultimately went back

5 to Schiff Hardin & Waite and -- Covar & Nelson

6 (phonetic), something or something. I don't remember 7 what it was.

At any rate, then, from there I went to the 9 Department of Justice in Chicago, and I was a federal 10 prosecutor with the Department of Justice from 1987 11 until the year 2000, at which point I became a

12partner of the law firm of Altheimer & Gray in

13Chicago, and I was at Altheimer & Gray until July of 142000, at which point I came to Sonnenschein and have 15been a partner here ever since.

16 Q All right, sir. When you were with the 17Department of Justice, would you tell us what your 18job consisted of, what did you do for them?

19 A Well, the -- the way the office in Chicago is 20structured is that you go through various divisions. 21For the first three years I was in the civil 22division, and I did primarily tort defense work and 23money laundering, civil money laundering work.

Then I went to what they call the criminal

Page 6

- 1 Q And could you describe for us the nature of 2 your practice?
- 3 A I am a trial lawyer, litigator. I do -- you 4 want to know the kinds of litigation I do?
- 5 Q If you wouldn't mind, yes, sir.
- 6 A I do all major complex commercial litigation, 7 white collar criminal defense, and government 8 regulatory and government investigations.
- 9 Q All right, sir. And I'm sure as an attorney 10you're licensed to practice law. In what states are 11you licensed?
- 12 A Illinois.
- 13 Q Could you describe for us your educational 14background, please?
- 15 A Yes. I have a Bachelor of Arts from the
  16University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, I have a
  17Masters of Divinity from University of Notre Dame,
  18and I have a Juris Doctorate from DePaul University
  19College of Law.
- 20 Q When did you graduate from law school?
- 21 A 1986.
- 22 Q Could you describe your work experience 23following your graduation from law school?
- 24 A Yes. I was briefly at a labor litigation

- 1 receiving appellate division for about a year, year 2 and a half, and you do criminal appeals and do sort 3 of intake work to give you training for the criminal 4 prosecutions.
- From there I went to major crimes, which was 6 a more white collar prosecution. From there I went 7 to the -- it's called OCDETF is the acronym, and I 8 think it's called Organized -- Organized Crime and 9 Drug Task Force or something. It was major -- major 10drug cases, and from there I went to special 11prosecutions, in which I did public corruption and 12terrorism investigations.
- 13 Q When did you go to special prosecutions --
- 14 A Oh, boy.
- 15 Q -- and terrorism?
- 16 A You know, Mr. Babcock, I don't know. It 17would have been in the early 90s, say '93 or 4, but I 18really, without having, you know, my personnel file 19or something, I couldn't tell you exactly.
- 20 Q Okay. No, that's fair enough. Thank you.
- And could you give us a little -- a sense 22 obviously -- well, maybe not obviously. Were you 23 acting as an attorney for the Department of Justice 24 when you were in the special -- special prosecutions

4

1 and terrorism division?

- A Yes.
- Q All right. And can you give us a sense as an 4 attorney what -- what you did generally with respect 5 to the cases that you handled?
- A Sure. I primarily worked with the FBI, but 7 there were other agencies that I would work with, 8 like IRS or INS, as well. And I would work with the 9 agents to investigate and develop criminal 10 prosecutions, and then we would put them together and 10 11 file an indictment with the -- return an indictment
- 12 from the grand jury and -- and prosecute the case --13 O All right.
- 14 A -- or have it pled out, depending on what 15happened.
- 16 Q All right, sir. While you were with -- and 17this took place all in Chicago, did it not?
- 18 A Yes.

24Betrayal?

19 Q All right, sir. While you were with the 20United States Attorney's Office, the Department of 21 Justice in the special prosecutions and terrorism 22 division, did you have an occasion to work on an 23 investigation that had a code name of Vulgar

Page 9

Page 11

Page 12

- 1 Exhibits 47 and 48 and tell me when you have gotten 2 those?
- 3 (Exhibit Nos. 47 and 48 tendered to the
  - Witness.)
- 5 A I have 47 and 48.
- Q All right, sir. Thank you.
- 7 47 is merely the notice of this deposition. 8 and we all appreciate your appearing to testify in 9 this proceeding.
- I want to turn to Exhibit 48, which I will 11represent to you is a transcript of an interview that 12you gave on December 6th of 2002 to ABC News. And my 13question is, do you recall being interviewed by ABC 14News in a -- in a taped -- videotaped proceeding?
- 15 A Yes, I do.
- 16 Q Would you take it -- the opportunity to look 17at Exhibit 48 and tell me if there is anything in 18there that at the time you gave this interview to ABC 19News you thought was untrue; in other words, you told 20them something that was false?
- 21 MR. KAITCER: I object to the form of the 22question.
- 23 THE COURT REPORTER: Who is that?
- 24 MR. KAITCER: I'm sorry, this is Jeff Kaitcer,

Page 10

A Yes, I did.

Q And I know there are certain restrictions on 3 things you can and can't say, but was there a public 4 proceeding incident to the Vulgar Betrayal 5 investigation that related to a civil forfeiture?

A Yes, there was a civil forfeiture case filed 7 against the QLI assets and assets of Mohammed Salah 7 answer to that is no. 8 and maybe one other entity. I don't remember exactly 8 BY MR. BABCOCK:

9 who all made claims for it in I think that was 1998.

- 10 O All right.
- 11 A And that was done with my approval.
- 12 Q All right, sir. And can you just give us a 13sense of what, in this context, the civil forfeiture 14 proceeding would consist of, what were the steps?
- 15 A Well, it -- the steps were that the Justice
- 17 filed a complaint seeking forfeiture for certain 18 assets that with we had alleged had been tainted as a
- 19 result of material support of terrorism, specifically
- 20Hamas, and we seized those assets, and then there was 20
- 21 civil litigation, which I believe is still pending in 22 front of Judge Andersen.
- 23 Q All right, sir. Thank you.
- If the court reporter would hand you 24

1 and I object to the form of the question.

- THE COURT REPORTER: Thank you.
- THE WITNESS: Mr. Babcock, I mean, your 4 representation that this is a transcript of the
- 5 interview, if taken that is true, the question is did
- 6 I say anything in the interview that was false, the

- Q All right. Thank you. Let me ask you to 10turn to Page 9 of the transcript. The Bate number at 11the bottom is ABC Hafiz 169.
- A Okay. I'm there.
- Q And down at the -- under it says Mark
- 14Flessner, it says, I was a prosecutor for 12 years.
- 15The Bureau was there to assist us as it -- as it
- 16Department here in Chicago through the civil division 16assists the prosecutors in the Department of Justice.
  - 17 Do you see where I'm reading from?
  - 18 A I do.
  - 19 Q And did I read it correctly?
  - A Yes, you did.
  - 21 Q All right. What -- what did you mean that
  - 22the Bureau is there to assist the prosecutors? 23 A Well, in the context of this case, the
  - 24prosecutors and the Bureau worked -- I don't know if

- 1 you would say hand in hand, but worked together to -1 I said.
- 2 to create a case. Ultimately, the prosecutor, the
- 3 one who is going to -- going to put the case on trial
- 4 before a court of law had to know what evidence was 4
- 5 admissible and what evidence was not admissible and 5 that.
- 6 -- and what were the elements of the crimes that 7 needed to be proved.
- So it was in every case I can think I worked
- 9 in that the prosecutor would ultimately make the call
- 10as to how the investigation was being directed in 11 order to prove the case that was at hand.
- 12 Q All right. And in the -- in the case of the
- 13Vulgar Betrayal investigation, who was the lead
- 14 prosecutor in that matter?
- 15 A Robert Wright.
- 16 Q I'm sorry, not the agent, but the prosecutor?
- 17 A On prosecutor, excuse me. That was me, Mark 17 18Flessner.
- 19 Q All right, sir. And the -- and the FBI agent
- 20 who was the lead was Mr. Wright?
- 21 A That's correct. I misspoke.
- Q That's quite all right. 22
- 23 Speaking of Mr. Wright, if you would turn to
- 24Page 17 of the transcript, the Bate number is ABC

- 2 BY MR. BABCOCK:
- Q All right, sir.
- A But I don't have a specific memory of saying
- Q Fair enough. We -- I think we've got a
- 7 videotape of it, but let me ask you this: As of
- 8 December 6th of 2002, did you believe that Mr. Wright
- 9 was an extraordinarily hard worker?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 MR. KAITCER: Objection as to form and leading.
- 12 THE WITNESS: The answer is yes.
- 13BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 14 O All right. And as of that date, did you
- 15believe that he was very bright?
- 16 A Yes.
- MR. KAITCER: Objection, form and leading. 18BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 19 Q And did you tell ABC in this taped interview 20as represented by the transcript that he was very 21bright?
- 22 MR. KAITCER: Objection, form and leading.
- 23 THE WITNESS: As it says here, yes.
- 24BY MR. BABCOCK:

Page 14

Page 16

- 1 Hafiz 177, tell me when you get there?
- A I'm here.
- Q All right. You'll see the interviewer is
- 4 asking you about Bob Wright, and would that be the
- 5 same Robert or Bob Wright who is the lead FBI agent 5
- 6 on the Vulgar Betrayal investigation?
- A Correct.
- Q All right, sir. And if you turn the page,
- 9 you tell ABC some things about Mr. Wright, correct?
- 10 A I haven't read this in some time, but I
- 11can -- I'm sure you're accurate if you just give me a 12second.
- 13 Q All right. Let me just pick out a few of the 14things you told ABC. Did you tell them that
- 15Mr. Wright was an extraordinarily hard worker?
- 16You'll see that down in the middle of the page.
- A Yes.
- 18 MR. KAITCER: I object to the form of the 19 question.
- 20 (Discussion had off the written record.)
- THE WITNESS: To answer your question, 21
- 22Mr. Babcock, again, taking your representation this
- 23is a complete and accurate transcript of the
- 24 interview, then that's what it says, and that's what

- Q All right. And as of December -- I keep 2 losing my date here -- as of December 6th, 2002, did 3 you believe that he was extremely organized?
- MR. KAITCER: Objection, form and leading.
- THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 6 BY MR. BABCOCK:
- Q And did you tell ABC that?
- MR. KAITCER: Objection, form and leading.
- THE WITNESS: Again, as reflected here, yes. 10BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 11 O All right, sir. Thank you.
- 12 And did you tell ABC that -- that Mr. Wright
- 13did a fantastic job in his investigation?
- MR. KAITCER: Objection, form and leading.
- THE WITNESS: Is that reflected someplace -- oh, 16I see it down here below. Again, given the accuracy
- 17 of this document, yes.
- 18BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 19 Q All right, sir. And as of December 6th, 2002
- 20 when you gave this interview, tell us whether or not 21 you believe that as of that time that Mr. Wright did
- 22a fantastic job with respect to the Vulgar Betrayal
- 23 investigation?
- 24 MR. KAITCER: Objection, form and leading.

Page 17

- THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 2 BY MR. BABCOCK:
- Q All right, sir. Has your opinion about 4 Mr. Wright changed between the date of the interview.
- 5 December 6th, 2002, and today?
- 6 A With respect to his work ethic and as
- 7 described here, no, it has not changed.
- Q Thank you. If you will turn to Page 22 of 9 the transcript, Bate number ABC Hafiz 182, you may
- 10have to actually look at the page before it to see
- 11that it's you that's speaking.
- 12 A Yeah, I'm there.
- 13 Q Okay. Great. Thanks.
- 14 There is a -- about two-thirds of the way
- 15down the page you speaking. It says, quote, The
- 16agent refused, based on religious reasons. What he
- 17said was it was against his religion to record
- 18 another Muslim. I was dumfounded by that response.
- 19 Do you see where I'm reading from?
- 20 A I do.
- 21 Q All right, sir. And were you speaking about 22Gamal Abdel-Hafiz with respect to the agent you're 23referring to there?
- A Yes.

Page 18

- Q And can you tell us whether -- whether or not
- 2 Mr. Abdel-Hafiz refused, based on religious reasons, 3 to record, secretly record another Muslim?
- MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection,
- THE WITNESS: Well, that's what he said to us 7 over the telephone.
- 8 BY MR. BABCOCK:
- Q And "he" being Abdel-Hafiz?
- 10 A Abdel-Hafiz, yes.
- 11 Q All right. I've heard it pronounced nine
- 12 different ways. I'm going with Mr. Kaitcer's
- 13pronunciation --
- 14 A Okay.
- 15 Q -- figuring since he represents him, he might
- 16know, but I could be wrong about that.
- 17 A Okay.
- Q What was -- what was your reaction to -- to
- 19Mr. Abdel-Hafiz saying that he would not secretly
- 20record another Muslim?
- 21 A I think he --
- 22 MR. KAITCER: Objection, form.
- 23 MR. BABCOCK: Excuse me?
- THE WITNESS: The description that I gave here of 24 chief -- I believe it was -- my memory is it was to

1 being dumfounded accurately describes it.

2 BY MR. BABCOCK:

- Q All right, sir. We're going to get into some
- 4 documents in a minute that have been produced to us 5 by the Department of Justice and the FBI, but did you
- 6 complain or raise the issue of Mr. Abdel-Hafiz --
- 7 Mr. Abdel-Hafiz's refusal to record this terrorism
- 8 suspect with other people in the Department of 9 Justice?
- 10 A Yes.
- 11 Q Can you tell us what you did in that regard?
- 12 A Again, I don't remember precisely, but my
- 13recollection is I pursued two avenues, one of which
- 14 was to complain through the bureaucracy in the FBI,
- 15specifically up to Kathleen McChesney, who was the
- 16Special Agent in Charge at the time, and I also
- 17 complained through the chain of command in the U.S.
- 18 Attorney's Office here in Chicago and the Department
- 19 of Justice, which would have gone up through the U.S.
- 20 Attorney Scott Lassar at the time, and then beyond
- 21that I'm not sure exactly how far beyond that it
- 22went.
- 23 Q All right. Let me -- let me take the last 24thing you talked about first. Your complaint up
  - Page 20
- 1 through the U.S. Attorney's Office through the U.S.
- 2 Attorney himself Scott Lassar and -- and beyond, was
- 3 that complaint oral or was it in writing or both?
- A My recollection, and I do not -- my
- 5 recollection is that I believe I wrote a memo, but I
- 6 do not precisely recall sitting at my computer doing
- 7 so, but I can tell you this is the kind of thing that
- 8 would have normally generated -- generated a memo 9 that would have gone up through the chain, but I just
- 10can't -- I can't exactly remember doing that, but
- 11 that is my belief that that's what happened.
- 12 Q All right.
- MR. KAITCER: Objection as to responsiveness. 13
- MR. BABCOCK: Thank you.
- 15BY MR. BABCOCK:
- Q And if you wrote this memo, do you recall who 17it would have been directed to, Mr. Lassar or someone
- 18else?
- A It would have been --19
- MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection, 20 21leading.
- MR. BABCOCK: Go ahead.
- 23 THE WITNESS: -- Scott Lassar or -- or one of his

2 BY MR. BABCOCK:

5 chain of command?

3 Q All right, sir. Did you -- did you complain

4 to anybody above Mr. Lassar in the U.S. Attorney

A Well, he was the U.S. Attorney at the time.

With respect to the first avenue that you

11the Special Agent in Charge Kathleen McChesney. Was

10talked about, you said you complained in the FBI to

13 A I do not -- again, my memory is very fuzzy on

15had conversations with Kathleen about this. Kathleen

14this, but I -- I know I had -- I'm pretty certain I

16 and I talked about this case with some regularity,

19that I actually drafted the memo, as I think about

21 may have assisted or drafted the memo, but there

23drafted to -- to confirm the -- what happened.

24 Q All right, sir. You say you had

17 and I -- my memory is that she was given a copy of

18whatever memo was drafted, and frankly, I'm not sure

20this more. I think someone else who was in the room

7 There would have been no one above him.

Q All right, sir. Thank you.

12that oral or was that in writing or both?

1 Scott.

Page 21

1 interview, then I did.

Q All right, sir. And I will represent to you 3 that it is, and -- and there are plenty of lawyers 4 around to challenge me if I'm wrong about that.

Page 23

Page 24

Can you -- can you elaborate on why it's not 6 an FBI agent's option to decide not to pursue a 7 criminal investigation?

A Well, I was not a FBI agent, but I worked 9 with the FBI for almost 13 years, 12½ years, more 10than 12½, and the FBI is a -- almost a paramilitary 11 organization in which they -- they're charged to 12prosecute -- you know, investigate cases, prosecute 13cases, defend the Constitution of the United States. They -- in my entire experience with the 15Department of Justice, I had never heard, nor was I 1 6ever aware, nor did I experience with the exception 17 of this case an agent refusing to participate in an 18 assignment or investigation for some religious or 19philosophical reason. It just was not an option --MR. KAITCER: Objection.

THE WITNESS: -- that was ever -- ever 22was -- my memory is that there was some memo that was 22communicated to me in any way.

> MR. BABCOCK: All right, sir. Thank you. 24BY MR. BABCOCK:

Page 22

1 conversations with the FBI Special Agent in Charge 2 Kathleen McChesney. Can you tell me what 3 conversations you had with Ms. McChesney about this 4 subject?

- A Precisely no. I can only tell you that I 6 would have related to her what happened, but I can't 7 in any more detail than that.
- Q Okay. Thank you very much.
- If you will turn on Exhibit 48 to Page 23, 11 yourself, the first three sentences, would you read 12that for the record out loud, please.
- 13 A It -- it -- it's not an agent's option 14to decide -- to decide -- it looks like there's a 15typo there -- to decide not to pursue a criminal 16 investigation. That's -- that's -- they don't have 17that choice. When they are told to assist in a 18criminal investigation, that's what they do. It's 19not -- it's not an organization that allows for 20philosophical differences.
- 21 Q Did you tell that to ABC on December 6th of 222002?
- 23 A Again, Mr. Babcock, if this -- if this 24 transcript is an accurate transcript of the

Q Turn to Page -- well, the Bate number is 186 2 down at the bottom.

A Okay.

Q And it's quoting you as saying, It was a key 5 link. It was a huge break in the investigation, but 6 ultimately, it didn't pan out to anything because of 7 the agent's refusal to cooperate.

What were you talking about there?

A I'm referring to the -- well, it's everything 10Bate numbered ABC Hafiz 183, and the quotation from 10we're talking about here. The -- Mr. Abdel-Hafiz had 11been approached by a witness who was to testify 12before the grand jury regarding the money laundering 13 and charity investigation, and we had asked him to 14 talk to the individual, the potential grand jury 15 witness, and to record the conversation to assist us 16to find out why he wanted to talk to an FBI agent 17 about it -- about a potential appearance before the 18 grand jury. That would have been an important break 19in the investigation to determine whether or not he 20 was going to be truthful, to be -- to be completely 21 accurate, or whether or not he was going to 22potentially perjure himself before the grand jury.

The agent's refusal, Abdel-Hafiz's refusal 24to participate in that undercover operation was a

LegaLink Dallas www.legalink.com 800-966-4567

- 1 fairly significant setback to the investigation.
- 2 Q All right, sir. We've talked a little bit 3 about this telephone call where Mr. Abdel-Hafiz 4 refused to participate in the secret recording of the 5 terrorism suspect. Can you tell us whether or not 6 you were on that telephone call?
- A I was on the telephone call. It was -- it 8 was in my office on my office phone.
- Q All right, sir. Turn to Page 29, Abdel-Hafiz 11the bottom of your quote there, it says, I am 12troubled by an agent who disobeys the rules and 13regulations for a personal belief.
- Again, assuming the transcript is correct, 15did you tell that to ABC?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 O And why were you troubled about 18Mr. Abdel-Hafiz's disobeying the rules and 1 9 regulations for a personal belief?
- 20 A Well, I -- it's just not the way it worked. 21In -- law enforcement cannot operate in a manner in 22which agents choose to or not to investigate a crime 23because of their personal beliefs.
- Their obligation is to investigate

Page 27

Page 28

- A Yes, I see that.
- Q And was there ever any mention of Special 3 Agent Abdel-Hafiz doing this secret monitoring in a 4 mosque?
- 5 A No.
- Q Where -- where was the secret monitoring --7 secret monitoring or secret taping to take place?
- A Well, we had as -- we had suggested a number 9 of places. As the conversation developed, initially 10189 is the Bate number on Exhibit 48. And down near 10Agent Abdel-Hafiz said he would not wear a wire on 11his person against another Muslim, and so I -- they 12were going to meet -- I mean, we hadn't arranged a 13location at that point.
  - Then I said, fine, if it's the fact that you 15won't wear a wire on your body, what was known, I 16think probably is still known as a body wire, we will 17set up a hotel room, we'll rent a hotel room, we'll 18put a camera, and we'll bug it, and you won't have to 19have a -- a wire on your body, we can do it that way. 20and he refused to do that as well, but at no time was 21there ever discussion to go into a mosque. That 22simply was never on the radar screen, and the 23political environment at the time never even would 24have permitted that.

- 1 violations of the law, and they don't -- it's like a 2 soldier. A soldier doesn't get to decide whether or 3 not to, you know, conduct an assignment. They are 4 instructed to do so, and they are -- that's what they 5 have to do.
- It's simply -- it is that kind of an 7 organization which requires the sort of obedience 8 within the law that -- that that agent should have 9 followed.
- 10 Q All right, sir. There is another exhibit, if 11the court reporter would hand you Exhibit 42, which 12has the Bate number USDJ 175 on the bottom.
- 13 (Exhibit No. 42 tendered to the Witness.)
- 14 A I'm looking at it right now.
- 15 O All right. If you will look at the -- well, 16 first of all, have you ever seen this Exhibit 42 17before?
- 18 A I do not believe so.
- 19 Q All right. Look at the last sentence. At 20the bottom it says, The SAC advised that had the
- 22other than a mosque, Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz would22I will tell you that this is a true and correct copy 23have supported the proposal.
- Did you see where I'm reading from?

- Q All right, sir. Let me ask you if the court 2 reporter can hand you Exhibit 49.
- (Exhibit No. 49 tendered to the Witness.)
- 4 A I have 49.
- Q All right, sir. I will again represent to 6 you that this is a true and correct transcript of a 7 news broadcast on March 4th, 2003 called The O'Reilly 8 Factor which is on the Fox News cable channel, and do 9 you recall being a guest on that program?
- 10 A I do, yes.
- Q All right, sir. Did you tell Mr. O'Reilly or 12the Fox News people anything that was false?
- 13 A No, I did not.
- 14 Q And looking at the quotes that are attributed 15to you, again, assuming that I have provided you an 1 6accurate transcript of that videotaped program, are 17the things that you related on that program, are they 18true?
- 19 A Yes.
- 20 (Exhibit No. 50 tendered to the Witness.)
- 21consensual monitoring been requested for any location 21 Q Take a look at Exhibit 50, if you would. And 23of a broadcast, The O'Reilly Factor where Bill
  - 240'Reilly is the host, and I don't see that you were a

1 guest on that program, but I could be wrong, and I 2 guess tell me with or without reference to this

- 3 document whether you believe you were a guest on that 3
- A I believe I was only a guest on The O'Reilly 6 Factor once.
- Q All right, sir.
- A So if I was on the 4th, I couldn't have been 9 on the 5th as well.
- 10 Q All right, sir. I don't -- I don't think you 11were. I haven't looked at the program, but you're 12the one testifying. Mr. Kaitcer concurs in my -- in 13that judgment. So we'll leave that exhibit.
- 14 (Exhibit No. 51 tendered to the Witness.)
- 15 Q Look at Exhibit 51, if you would. This is, I 16will represent to you, a transcript of a -- of a 17third O'Reilly Factor program dated March 6th, 2003, 18 and I don't believe you were a guest on that program
- 1 9either. I think that honor belonged to Mr. Vincent, 20but confirm that for me, if you would?
- A Again, it's my recollection, Mr. Babcock, 22that I only appeared on that show -- I mean, if you
- 23have a tape that can prove me wrong, prove me wrong 24but my recollection is that I only appeared on The

Page 29

MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection, 2 leading.

- THE WITNESS: Essentially it is. I can't say 4 it's verbatim, but it's substantively accurate, yes. 5 BY MR. BABCOCK:
- Q All right, sir. Can you tell us whether or 7 not Mr. Vincent was on that -- on that conference 8 call as well?
- A Mr. Vincent was in the room, ves.
- Q All right. And you say he was in the room.
- 11Does that mean he could or could not hear what was 12being said?
- A Yeah, it was on a speaker phone. There were 14 five or six people, four or five people in the room, 15 and it was on a speaker phone. My office was of the 16size that everyone in the room could -- could hear
- 18 Q All right, sir. Fair enough.
- 19 (Exhibit No. 11A tendered to the
- 20 Witness.)
- Q Let me ask you to turn to a document that has 22been previously marked as Exhibit 11A. And it is a 23document that is produced to us by the United States 24Department of Justice, although it has some

Page 30

- 1 O'Reilly Factor once.
- Q Right. And I think -- we can't prove you 3 wrong. I think all our information proves you 4 correct on that.
- If you will look at Exhibit 51, this is 6 Mr. Vincent speaking down at the bottom of Page 1, 7 carrying over to Page 2, it's Bate numbered FOX 216. 8 And it says the following, read along with me, make 9 sure I'm reading it correctly: At that conference
- 10call U.S. Attorney Mark Flessner asked Agent Gamal if10investigation, so I -- I can't -- I just can't tell
- 11he would use a wire to record the conversation that
- 12potentially was going to take place. At that time, 13Gamal refused. U.S. Attorney Mark Flessner pressed
- 14him and asked him why he wouldn't, and Gamal said hel 4document in its entirety, but I just can't remember.
- 15wouldn't understand, it's a cultural thing. At that
- 16time Flessner pushed further and finally Gamal said a 17 Muslim does not record another Muslim.
- 18 Did I read that correctly?
- 19 A You did, sir.
- 20 MR. KAITCER: Objection as to form.
- 21BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 22 Q And is Mr. Vincent's recitation essentially 23what you recall from that telephone conference call 24that you were on?

- 1 reductions in it. It's dated April 16th, 1999, and 2 it's from Chicago, drafted by Agent Wright, and to 3 Dallas National Security and a number of other 4 people. Do you have it yet?
- A I have it, yes, sir.
- Q Have you ever seen this document before? 6
- A Other than today I -- I do not believe I
- 8 have, but you know, it's -- you know, there were
- 9 hundreds and hundreds of 302s produced in this
- 11you for sure.
- Q Okay. Fair enough.
- A It's very possible I saw the original
- Q All right. There is a -- if you'll turn to 16Page 5, and it's Bate numbered USDJ 118?
- 17 A Yes.
- Q And it's the third full paragraph. It says,
- 19AUSA Flessner explained the significance of the
- 20contact made by blank, and the potential significance
- 21 of a contact with redacted as yielding: (1) possible
- 22evidence of mens rea or knowledge of wrongdoing, and
- 23(2) lines of inquiry that would possibly constitute
- 24an obstruction of justice violation. SA Abdel-Hafiz

Page 35

- 1 was asked by the Chicago AUSAs whether he would be 1
  2 willing to meet with redacted and record the 2
  3 conversation by wearing a body recorder. Special 3
  4 Agent Abdel-Hafiz was told that the recording would 5 protect him and in addition provide the best possible 5
- Do you recall participating in a telephone conversation on a conference call where you said these things?
- 10 A Yes.

6 evidence for the case.

- 11 MR. KAITCER: Object to the form; objection, 12leading.
- 13 THE WITNESS: Yes, the answer is yes. 14BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 15 Q All right. Going on, it says, Special Agent 16Abdel-Hafiz related that he would be willing to meet 17with redacted and the redacted things appear to be 18names, would you agree with me?
- 19 MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection, 20leading.
- 21 THE WITNESS: I believe it's the name of the 22potential witness.

23BY MR. BABCOCK:

9 himself and his family.

24 Q All right. Or anybody else, but that he did

Speaking of the devil, Mr. Abdel-Hafiz has 2 just walked in the room.

3 Forgetting about my sidebar and

- 4 Mr. Abdel-Hafiz coming here, do you recall that -- 5 what I just read was a part of the telephone
- 6 conversation between you and the others on the 7 telephone call with Agent Abdel-Hafiz?
- 8 MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection, 9 leading.
- 10 THE WITNESS: Essentially, yes, that is correct. 11BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 12 Q And you say essentially yes. Is there any -- 13 anywhere where your memory differs from what is on 14 this Exhibit 11A which I've just read to you?
- 15 A No, I think it's accurate. I just don't -- I 16just don't think it's verbatim.
- 17 Q All right. The next paragraph says, Special 18Agent Abdel-Hafiz asked why it was necessary to 19record a conversation with redacted. AUSA Flessner 20explained that it was necessary to protect the agent 21to assure that any false representations about what 22the agent said or did in the conversation could be 23disproved.
- 24 Do you recall that being said on this

Page 34

Page 36

- 1 not want to wear a body recorder or consent to any 2 other type of consensual recording. When the AUSA 3 asked for an explanation, Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz 4 stated that the recording would be subject to 5 discovery at a later time, and that could possibly be 6 learned in the Muslim community in Dallas and 7 elsewhere that he was doing this. He expressed that 8 disclosure would create a grave safety issue for
- When AUSA Flessner told Special Agent 11Abdel-Hafiz that any safety risks would be addressed 12by the FBI, Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz responded that 13he did not trust the FBI to protect him or his 14family.
- When asked by AUSA Chanenson why he thought 15
  16would he face safety risks, Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz
  17responded that the secret recording of a conversation
  18between Muslims is regarded in the Muslim culture as
  19the ultimate act of betrayal.
- When the AUSA Flessner asked why it was any 21different from reducing a conversation with a 22criminal subject to a FD-302 and testifying about the 23conversation, Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz related that 24it was a cultural matter that we wouldn't understand.

- 1 telephone conference?
- 2 MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection, 3 leading.
- 4 THE WITNESS: Yes, I do, Mr. Babcock.
- 5 MR. BABCOCK: Thank you.

6 BY MR. BABCOCK:

- 7 Q And could you explain for me how recording a 8 conversation with a terrorism suspect would protect 9 the agent?
- 10 A Well, let me -- let me first qualify that. I 11didn't say that the potential witness was a terrorism 12suspect. I said he was a potential witness for the 13grand jury.
- 14 Q Okay. Thank you.
- 115 A But any recording of a conversation would
  16disabuse those later who were to hear of the
  17conversation about whether it was a he said/she said
  18type of thing because we would have -- we would have
  19the recording. We would know exactly what was said
  20and by whom and when.
- So it -- it -- a recording, undercover 22recording obviously is the best way and the most 23accurate way to make sure that you have an accurate 24record of the conversation because if an agent were

- 1 to just to, then, after the conversation write down 2 what he remembered being said, it wouldn't be as 3 complete and accurate as the recording would be 4 obviously.
- Q Fair enough. Thank you.
- 6 The next paragraph references a 3:30 p.m. 6 7 telephone conference between the Chicago AUSA's and 7
- 8 SSA Patton regarding the same subject matter as the 9 10:00 a.m. call. Do you recall what -- what
- 10transpired on that 3:30 telephone conference?
- 11 A No, I do not.
- 12 Q Okay. It says, then, that Scott Lassar,
- 13United States Attorney for the Northern District of
- 14Texas was briefed about the reluctance of Special 15Agent Abdel-Hafiz --
- 16 MR. KAITCER: Chip, you said -- you said -- I 17think you said Northern District of Texas. It says 18Northern District of Illinois.
- 19 MR. BABCOCK: Let me back up. You got me out 20of -- out of sync being here taking a Chicago
- 21deposition. Let me strike that and ask this 22question.
- 23BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 24 Q The -- the Exhibit 11A goes on to say that

Page 38

- 1 Scott R. Lassar, United States Attorney for the 2 Northern District of Illinois, was briefed about the 3 reluctance of Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz to record a 4 possible meeting that he might have with a prime 5 target of the Vulgar Betrayal matter.
- 6 Did I read that correctly?
- 7 A Yes, sir.
- 8 Q And was the United States Attorney for the 9 Northern District of Illinois briefed about this 10matter?
- 11 A Yes, sir.
- 12 MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection, 13leading.
- 14 MR. BABCOCK: Go ahead.
- 15 THE WITNESS: He was, yes.
- 16BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 17 Q And who participated in that briefing?
- 18 A I know I was there. I believe AUSA Steve
- 19Chanenson was there, and I -- I'm less certain, but I 20believe AUSA Joe Ferguson was also there.
- 21 Q All right. And what did -- what did you tell 22the United States Attorney for the Northern District 23of Illinois about this matter?
- 24 A Well, that we had had an opportunity to

Page 39

- 1 record a conversation -- an agent had been approached
- 2 about a potential grand jury appearance by a
- 3 potential witness, and that we had requested the
- 4 agent meet with the grand jury witness and discuss
- 5 whatever it is he wanted to discuss and to record the
- 6 conversation, the agent refused to do so.
- 7 Q You say here that this person that Agent 8 Abdel-Hafiz was -- Strike that.
- 9 Exhibit 11A describes the person that 10Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz was to record but refused
- 11 was a prime target of the Vulgar Betrayal matter.
- 12Can you tell us whether that is accurate or not?
- 13 A You know, I don't remember that. Is that -- 14 is that what it says?
- 15 Q Yes, take a look at Page 6.
- 16 A Oh, I see it. Okay. Well, I mean if he was, 17he was. I just don't remember -- there were a lot -- 18there were a lot of targets of this investigation. I
- 1 9 just don't remember exactly that person being a prime 20 target, but if that's what it was at the time, then 21 it was.
- 22 Q All right. The very last sentence of Exhibit 2311A says that both USA Lassar and SAC -- and what 24does SAC stand for again?

- 1 A Special Agent in Charge.
- 2 Q -- McChesney agreed that the FBI should 3 pursue the effort to obtain this evidence.
- 4 Did I read that correctly?
- 5 A Yes, you did.
- 6 Q And what is your understanding of after this 7 telephone conversation and after all the
- 8 conversations that you were a party to was the 9 position of the U.S. attorney and the Special Agent 10in Charge McChesney?
- 11 A Both Kathleen and Scott backed our position 12that this was an important lead in the investigation
- 13and should be pursued, and that we should continue to
- 14 seek the cooperation of Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz and
- 15the Texas field office -- or the Dallas field office.
- 16 Q All right, sir. If you'll turn to the next 17page of Exhibit 11A, it's got -- it says, To:
- 18Dallas; From: Chicago; Re:, and it has got a number
- 19dated April 16th, 1999. And then it has -- it says
  20lead; Set Lead; Dallas; at Dallas Texas. Do you know
- 21 what that "Lead", "Set Lead" business means?
- 22 A A lead would be one field office, this being
- 23the Chicago field office, sending to the Dallas field 24office, the FBI field office, to request assistance.

- Q All right. And the first paragraph says, The
- 2 Dallas division has requested to have Special Agent
- 3 Gamal Abdel-Hafiz inform redacted to tell redacted
- 4 that Abdel-Hafiz is willing to meet with redacted
- 5 regarding the Chicago grand jury and its
- 6 investigation. It is further requested that Special
- 7 Agent Abdel-Hafiz meet with redacted in Dallas and
- 8 consensually monitor the meeting.
- "Consensually monitor" means what?
- A A consensually monitored conversation is
- 11 consented by one of the individuals in the
- 12 conversation; in this case would have been Special
- 13 Agent Abdel-Hafiz. Not consensually by all parties.
- 14 It only has to be consented to by the law enforcemen 15officer.
- 16 Q I see. Okay. And then presumably in this
- 17 instance the suspect or the target or whatever you
- 18 want to call him wouldn't not know about the fact
- 19that he is being monitored?
- Q And then it says in 11A, Should redacted
- 22prefer to conduct the conversation with Special Agent22overtly recording a meeting between him and the
- 23Abdel-Hafiz on the telephone, Chicago requests that 23suspect?
- 24redacted be called at his residence after work hours,

Page 43

- 1 States Department of Justice under Bate number 124 2 It's dated May 17th, 1999.
- And my first question to you is going to be 4 whether you've ever seen this before?
- A Again, Mr. Babcock, as I said, there were 6 hundreds of --
- O Sure, I understand.

18 investigation.

- A 302s produced in this case, which in due 9 course would have been produced to me, but I -- the 10 answer is I just don't know. I don't recall.
- 11 Q All right. Fair enough. On the first page 12 of Exhibit 40, it says that, The Chicago Division and 13the U.S. Attorney's Office for the Northern District 14 of Texas are both of the opinion that an overtly --15 overtly reported meeting between Special Agent 16Abdel-Hafiz and redacted would be unproductive and, 17 in fact, possibly detrimental to the Vulgar Betrayal
- 19 Can you tell us what the facts were with A Not presumably, he absolutely would not know 20 respect to your opinion in the U.S. Attorney's Office 21 about the possibility of Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz
  - 24 MR. KOSKI: For the record, you substituted Texas

Page 42

1 and that the conversation also be consensually 2 monitored.

- 3 Did I read that correctly?
- Q And was that your request and the U.S.
- 6 Attorney's and the Special Agent in Charge
- 7 McChesney's request to Dallas and to Special Agent
- 8 Abdel-Hafiz?
- 9 A Yes.
- 10 MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection,
- 11leading.
- 12 THE WITNESS: Yes, we wanted the conversation 12 colleagues, unilaterally rejected that idea because I 13recorded.
- 14BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 15 Q All right. And what was the result of that 1 6request?
- 17 A It was denied.
- 18 Q Was the conversation with this witness or 19target, whatever you may want to call him, ever 20 consensually monitored, secretly recorded?
- 21
- 22 (Exhibit No. 40 tendered to the Witness.)
- Q Turn to Exhibit 40, if you would, and this is

- Page 44
- 1 for Illinois again, but with that correction, the 2 witness can respond.
- MR. BABCOCK: Sorry. It's a bad habit.
- THE WITNESS: My recollection is that Special
- 5 Agent Abdel-Hafiz said the only circumstance under 6 which he would record the conversation with a meeting
- 7 with the with the potential grand jury witness
- 8 would be if he could disclose to the witness that he
- 9 was recording -- that the agent was recording the 10conversation.
- 11 I really, without even consulting with my
- 13did not want the -- I didn't want a prepared or a
- 14 statement which could ultimately do us harm. I
- 15 wanted to find out what the truth was and what the
- 16actual witness wanted. I didn't need any kind of
- 17 exculpatory statement or planned statement that could
- 18have ultimately harmed the investigation. I wanted
- 19to know what it is exactly he wanted to find out from
- 20the agent and what his curiosity was about the status 21of the grand jury investigation.
- 22BY MR. BABCOCK:
- 23 Q All right. And -- and having been involved 24a document that's been produced to you by the United24in your line of work for a number of years. I have a

1 pretty good sense of why you thought an overt 2 recording might provoke a self-serving statement, but 3 could you explain that for us?

- MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection, 5 leading.
- MR. BABCOCK: He doesn't like my personal homily 7 so I'll -- I'll restate the question.
- 8 BY MR. BABCOCK:
- Q Would you explain for us why you thought an 10 overt recording might provoke a self-serving 11statement from the witness?
- 12 A Well, clearly if the witness knew that he was 13being recorded for later use, that No. 1, he -- it 14 was virtually certain that he would not inculpate 15himself into any of the targeted violations that we 16were investigating. In fact, the likely scenario 17 would be he would exculpate himself and give a story
- 19 In my experience, I -- I never once agreed 20to have an overt recorded conversation with a target 21or a potential witness to give the witness a free 22rein as to just to give exculpatory statements. That 23would never prove to be fruitful.

18that he wanted to report to derail the investigation.

24 Q All right, sir. Sticking here with Exhibit

Page 45

1 pressed them repeatedly to -- to go down the path of 2 the covert recording, but to have a specific memory 3 of a decision and then reconsider, I don't remember

4 that.

- 5 Q All right, sir. Just a few more questions 6 and I think I'm going to be true to my prediction of 7 an hour or less of questioning.
- Did you have occasion while you were the 9 Assistant U.S. Attorney in the Northern District of 10Illinois to work with Special Agent Vincent? 11 A Yes.
- 12 Q And if -- and what was -- what was your 13 experience with Special Agent Vincent in terms of his 14 competence, integrity, just his overall abilities on 15the job?
- 16 A I think I'm on the record as saying that 17 already, and Mr. Vincent is sitting here in the room, 18but Mr. Vincent was a very -- is -- I guess was 19because he's retired -- a very fine FBI agent.
- 20 He was -- if Bob was the lead agent on this 21 massive investigation, John was his co-equal or 22right-hand man. He was -- came to the investigation 23 with a lot of years of terrorism experience. I was 24not an experienced terrorism prosecutor at the time,

Page 46

1 40, the next paragraph on Page 2, it says based upon 2 the -- Strike that.

- It says, Based upon the suspicious activity 4 linking, and there's a lengthy redaction, the Vulgar 5 Betrayal matter, Chicago suspects that a covertly 6 recorded interview of redacted could be productive 7 from an investigative standpoint.
- Was that your view at the time of this memo?
- 9 MR. KAITCER: Objection, form; objection, 10leading.
- 11 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 12BY MR. BABCOCK:

22reconsider?

- 13 Q Going forward and reading the memo, it says, 14Chicago suspects that a covertly recorded interview 15of redacted could be productive from an investigative 16standpoint. Dallas is requested to reconsider 17proceeding with the covert recording, if, at any time 18 in the future, the perceived problem of consensually 19monitoring a Muslim seeking advice regarding a major 19 Q We're having Chicago-type weather down here. 20U.S. government criminal investigation is overcome. 21 Was -- were you the one requesting Dallas to
- 23 A I mean, I don't remember specifically,
- 24Mr. Babcock, asking for reconsideration. We -- we

Page 47

- 1 and he brought a lot of wisdom, depth, and insight 2 into the investigation.
- MR. BABCOCK: Mr. Flessner, thank you so much for 4 your time. I'm afraid that your -- your turn in the 5 barrel is not over because Mr. Kaitcer may have some 6 questions. Perhaps Mr. Hutton will, but -- and I 7 might have some follow-up, but I'll pass the witness
- 8 for now, and if you-all want to take a break now or 9 at any time just holler out at us.
- 10 MR. KOSKI: We can -- we can -- we can continue 11here.
- 12 MR. BABCOCK: Great. Thank you.
- 13 **EXAMINATION**

14BY MR. KAITCER:

- Q Mr. Flessner, my name is Jeff Kaitcer.
- A Hello, Mr. Kaitcer.
- Q How are you doing today?
- 18 A I'm fine. Thank you. How are you?
- 20It's very foggy and wet and a little chilly, but
- 21we'll live.
- 22 A It's beautiful and sunny here, Mr. Kaitcer.
- 23 Q Well, my ex-wife lives in Chicago. That's 24not enough to make me want to go back.

Page 52

Page 49

- A I'm not going there.
- MR. BABCOCK: We'll have no comment on that. 3 BY MR. KAITCER:
- Q In any event, you and I have never met, have 5 we?
- 6 A Not to my knowledge.
- Q I represent Special Agent Gamal Abdel-Hafiz,

9 questions.

- Obviously, you're an attorney, so you know 11 what a deposition is?
- 12 A I do.
- 13 Q What did you do to prepare yourself for this 14 deposition?
- 15 A Not much. I was -- when I was on a 16conference call earlier this morning, I was given a 17 stack of documents which I maybe spent 5 minutes 18 looking, perusing, but I did not have an opportunity 19to read. I talked a little bit with the firm's 20 general counsel a couple of times, cumulatively 21probably less than ten of minutes. I think that's
- 22about it. 23 Q Have you talked to Mr. Babcock or any other 24 attorneys acting on behalf of either Fox or ABC?

Q Yes, sir.

- A Yes.
- Q Do you have Exhibit No. 50 in front of you?
- A Give me a minute, please.
- 5 O Certainly.
- 6 A Yes.
- Q The first page of Exhibit No. 50, it is Bates 8 who is here today with me. Let me ask you some brief? stamped FOX 209 on the bottom, do you see that?
  - A Yes.
  - Q There is a statement made about two-thirds of 11the way down there and the statement says, according
  - 12to FBI Agent Robert Wright and former federal

  - 13prosecutor Mark Flessner, Hafiz declined to secretly
  - 14tape a Saudi citizen named Yassin Kadi who was
  - 15suspected of financing Usama bin Laden.
  - 16 Did I read that statement correctly?
  - 17 A You did.
  - Q Is that statement truthful?
  - 19 MR. BABCOCK: I'll just interpose an objection
  - 20here. We have been prevented by the government from
  - 21 learning who it was that Mr. Abdel-Hafiz was asked to
  - 22secretly tape. So to the extent that they have
  - 23 asserted a State Secrets Privilege, we will, too, but

24that doesn't mean you can't answer, I'm just

- A I met with Mr. Babcock prior to the 2 contemplation of this deposition. I'd have to look
- 3 at my calendar, but it seems to me it's well over
- 4 four weeks ago, but I don't know exactly when it was.
- 5 It's within 2006, but it's not in the last three or 6 four weeks.
- Q Where did that meeting take place?
- A Here in Chicago in my office. I wasn't -- it 9 was one of the conference rooms in -- here at 10Sonnenschein.
- 11 Q And what was discussed at that meeting?
- 12 A He basically went over what we went over here12 secrets privilege with respect to this information,
- 13today, and he asked me to sign an affidavit to that
- 14 effect, and I said I needed to run that by the
- 15general counsel of the firm, and I did, and it was
- 16decided that a deposition would be a more appropriatel 6BY MR. KAITCER: 17 forum.
- Q Have you spoken with anybody else?
- A About this deposition? 19
- 20 Q Yes.
- A No.
- 22 Q Do you have the exhibits there in front of 23you?
- A I do. The ones that I've reviewed earlier?

- 1 asserting that objection.
- MR. KOSKI: Let's go off the record a second so 3 we can confer here.
- 4 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We're going off the record at
- (Recess was taken.)
- THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the 8 record at 2:11.
- MR. KOSKI: I'll just make a statement rather
- 10than rereading the prior question. Given my
- 11understanding that the government has invoked the
- 13I'm going to instruct the witness not to answer the
- 14 question until such time as we have confirmation that
- 15that information can be disclosed by him.

- 17 Q Are you going to follow your attorney's
- 18 instruction, Mr. Flessner?
- A I am, sir.
- 20 Q Okay. Well, let me ask you this: Did you
- 21tell Bill O'Reilly that Hafiz declined to secretly
- 22tape a Saudi citizen named Yassin Kadi who was
- 23suspected of financing Usama bin Ladin?
- A I have not have a conversation with

- 1 Mr. O'Reilly that was not recorded on national 2 television.
- 3 Q Okay.
- A So whatever conversations I've had with 5 Mr. O'Reilly, you probably have seen a transcript of.
- Q Did you make any statements to anybody that 7 Hafiz declined to secretly tape a Saudi citizen named 8 Yassin Kadi?
- MR. KOSKI: Well, I object to the form of that 10 question because it's broad enough to encompass 11Mr. Flessner's conversation with others in the 12 government. Do you mean others in the media?
- 13 MR. KAITCER: All right. Others in the media, 14I'll let him do that one, too. Let me ask -- let me 15ask -- let me get this done, too.

## 16BY MR. KAITCER:

- 17 Q Are you refusing to answer that question?
- MR. KOSKI: Well, I'll instruct -- I'll instruct 19the witness not to answer it because I think -- for 20the same reasons previously articulated.
- 21 THE WITNESS: I'll follow the instruction. 22BY MR. KAITCER:
- 23 Q Thank you, Mr. Flessner.
- Now, did you tell anyone in the media that

Page 53

- Q You had known -- you knew who he was, right?
- A Yes, I certainly knew who he was.
- O Okay. And he was considered then and 4 possibly is still considered as a terrorism suspect, 5 as Mr. Babcock put it?
- MR. KOSKI: I'll raise my same objection and 7 instruct the witness not to answer.
- 8 BY MR. KAITCER:
- Q Is that your response, Mr. Flessner?
- 10 A Yeah, I can't answer that question.
- 11 Q Okay. Did Mr. Vincent know who Hafiz was 12requested to secretly tape?
- 13 A I don't know what Mr. Vincent knew.
- 14 Q Was Yassin Kadi considered an important 15 figure in this investigation by you?
- 16 A The status of Mr. Kadi I think is probably 17not public information. He was one of many, many, 18many people who -- to whom I gave attention in the 19 investigation.
- 20 Q Okay. Now, when Mr. Babcock was asking you 21 about terrorism suspects, you, I think, corrected him 22and indicated that the particular person you were 23talking about was not necessarily a -- Hafiz 24allegedly refused to record was not a prime suspect,

Page 54

Page 56

Page 55

- 1 Hafiz declined to secretly tape a Saudi citizen named 2 Yassin Kadi?
- A I have no recollection of ever identifying 4 any of the potential witnesses, and I believe that 5 information was not -- I don't know how that 6 information was disclosed to the media.
- Q Okay. Do you know whether or not Robert 8 Wright told Bill O'Reilly that Hafiz declined to 9 secretly tape a Saudi citizen named Yassin Kadi?
- 10 A No, I have no way of knowing that.
- Q Now, Yassin Kadi was a fairly well known 12individual to the Department of Justice in 1999, was 13he not?
- 14 MR. KOSKI: Well, I'll object to the -- to that 15question. I'm not sure how the witness can answer it 16without getting into the concerns I've previously 17articulated.

## 18BY MR. KAITCER:

- 19 Q You going to follow your attorney's 20instructions, Mr. Flessner?
- 21 A Well, I don't -- when you say the Department 22of Justice, he was known by me, if that -- if I'm --23embody me to the Department of Justice. I -- I 24really don't.

- 1 is that right?
- MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form.
- MR. KAITCER: You can answer it.
- THE WITNESS: I'm -- I'm trying to think of how 5 to answer it. My answer is that the -- the word
- 6 "target" in a criminal investigation is a term of
- 7 art, and it means, under the Department of Justice
- 8 guidelines, that it is in the judgment of the
- 9 prosecutor that individual is going to be charged.
- We were looking at a lot of people and a lot 11of transactions, hundreds of thousands if not 12 millions of banking transactions in which many people 13were involved. We had not designated anyone under
- 14the term of art "target" at that stage. 15BY MR. KAITCER:
- Q Okay. Did this individual that Hafiz did not 17want to record, was he ever a target to your 18knowledge?
- 19 A I can't answer that, Mr. Kaitcer. I'm sorry. 20I couldn't remember your name.
- Q Kaitcer. 21
- 22 A Kaitcer. I'm sorry.
- 23 Q That's all right. Since you and I have never
- 24met, I don't expect you to remember my name or how to

Page 57

1 pronounce it.

- 2 You indicated you had a lot of respect for 3 Special Agent John Vincent, is that correct?
- 4 A Yes.
- 5 Q And did he have a greater knowledge of who 6 the targets were and where the investigation might 7 lead than you did?
- 8 A Well, again, you're misunderstanding the term 9 "target". The -- the way --
- 10 Q You're right. I'll start over. Let me -- 11let me rephrase that.
- 12 A Okay.
- 13 Q Did Mr. Vincent have a greater sense of who 14might be important to an investigation, because he 15worked on it every day, than you did?
- 16 MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form.
- 17 MR. KAITCER: You can answer.
- 18 THE WITNESS: I don't know how to answer. I
- 19don't know the answer to that question.
- 20BY MR. KAITCER:
- 21 Q You're aware that Mr. Vincent appeared on the 22Bill O'Reilly show on March 6th, 2003 shortly after 23you did, you aware of that?
- 24 A Well, I am now. I'm not sure I knew at the

1 A Yes.

2 MR. BABCOCK: Actually, it says, We don't really 3 know.

4 BY MR. KAITCER:

- 5 Q I'm sorry, it says, We don't really know. We 6 didn't talk to the man.
- 7 Do you see where it says that?
- 8 A I do. I understood the first time.
- 9 Q Do you -- no, I'm just trying to clear it for 10Mr. Babcock.
- Do you have any information that would lead 12you to believe that the guy that you wanted to -- 13Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz to record was, in fact,
- 14 important?
- 15 A I'm -- the only reason I'm hesitating, 16Mr. Kaiteer, is because the way you phrased the
- 17 question. It was a very important part of the
- 18 investigation, and part of the investigation died
- 19because of Agent Abdel-Hafiz's refusal to cooperate.
- 20But so -- so the answer is I do understand how
- 21important it was. I don't -- I don't -- I guess I 22disagree with your -- your emphasis on the
- 23individual. I'm more concerned about the event.
- 24 Q You're concerned about the event. What event

Page 58

Page 60

1 time.

- 2 Q Okay.
- 3 A I don't remember knowing it.
- 4 Q You have Exhibit 51 in front of you?
- 5 A I'm trying to find it here. Hold on a 6 second, please. Yes.
- 7 Q And this is a document that was produced to 8 us by Fox Network that is a transcript of a -- a 9 portion of The O'Reilly Factor television show that 10took place on March 6th, 2003. Do you see that on 11the first page?
- 12 A That's what it says.
- 13 Q If you would look at the page that's Bates 14stamped FOX 218?
- 15 A Sure.
- 16 Q And you see where Mr. O'Reilly asks
- 17Mr. Vincent, Now, how important was the guy you were 17FBI.

18trying to get?

- Do you see that about the fourth paragraph 20down?
- 21 A Yes.
- 22 Q Mr. Vincent's response was, Well, we really 23don't know. We never did talk to the man.
- 24 Do you see where it says that there?

1 is that?

- 2 A The event of -- of recording --
- 3 Q Okay.
- 4 A -- one or more individuals with respect to 5 the grand jury investigation.
- 6 Q Well, let's talk about the issue of the 7 recording. You mentioned that — I think you 8 mentioned that the FBI is almost like a paramilitary 9 organization, isn't that right?
- 10 A Yes. That's my description of it. I'm not 11 sure they would describe themselves the same way.
- 12 Q Okay. Now, you didn't work for the FBI, did 13you?
- 14 A No. I worked for the Department of Justice, 15 and the FBI is a -- is an arm of the Department of 16 Justice, but I was not a -- I did not belong to the
- 18 Q And you were not in the position to give 19 orders to individual FBI agents, were you?
- 20 A Well, again, I think you're misconstruing
- 21how -- the nature of the relationship. The
- 22Department of Justice works together. The prosecutor
- 23 and the agents work together to investigate and 24 prosecute cases. Ultimately, the person responsible

- 1 for the prosecution is the Assistant United States 2 Attorney, which ultimately -- which in this instance 3 was me.
- So did I ask individual agents, direct 5 individual agents to do specific things within the 6 investigation, and frankly within every investigation 7 I worked on, the answer to that is yes. Could an 8 agent say no, I never, with this exception, ever 9 recall that ever happening.
- 10 Q Well, isn't it true that as you observed the 11FBI as a paramilitary type of organization - and 12aren't there individuals to whom Special Agent 13Abdel-Hafiz is directly responsible in the chain of 14 command?
- 15 MR. KOSKI: Let me object to the form. Do you 16mean within the chain of command at the FBI? 17 MR. KAITCER: Yes, within the chain of command at 18the FBI.
- 19 THE WITNESS: Certainly he had supervisors. 20BY MR. KAITCER:
- 21 Q Okay. And do you know who those supervisors
- 23 A I -- I know I talked with at least one of 24them, but their names escape me. Ron Patton, I

Page 63

- Q And if his superiors at the Dallas office 2 ordered him not to perform the requested monitoring, 3 then he would be obliged to follow that direct order, 4 would he not?
- MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form.
- 6 MR. KAITCER: You can answer it.
- 7 THE WITNESS: That's not my recollection of what
- 8 happened. What happened was, based on my
- 9 conversations, both within the -- with Agent
- 10Abdel-Hafiz, I believe -- am I correct in saying his
- 11 supervisor is Ron Patton, is that -- do I have that
- 12name correct?
- MR. KAITCER: I believe so.
- THE WITNESS: -- and other people within the FBI 15 and U.S. Attorney's Office was the decision was left 16up to him, and they did not -- his superiors did not 17 issue orders one way or the other, that they let him 18make the decision. I was never made aware, if your 19 question is, that he was ordered not to participate 20in the investigation.
- 21BY MR. KAITCER:
- 22 **O** Okay.
- 23 A I -- I pressed that pretty firmly, I'm
- 24 confident.

Page 62

Page 64

- 1 believe, was his supervising agent, and there's a SAC 2 with whom I do not recall specifically having 3 conversations; however, I'm sure there was 4 information communicated back and forth. I don't 5 know if that was done through Kathleen or how it 6 was -- I just don't remember.
- Q Well, the SAC, which would be the Special 8 Agent in Charge, was, for the Dallas office, was 9 Danny Defenbaugh, isn't that right?
- 10 A Yes. Okay. You're better with names than I 11am.
- 12 Q And isn't it true that in the FBI hierarchy, 13Special Agent in Charge Defenbaugh has just as muchl 3
- 14rank, if you will, as Special Agent Kathleen
- 15McChesney in the Illinois office?
- 16 A They were both SACs. I think the -- I'm sure 17the Chicago office is much bigger. I don't know how 17against, while suggesting an alternative plan. 18 you would rank them in that regard.
- 19 Q But Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz was assigned to 19the Dallas office and Chicago agreed to abide by that 20the Dallas office and was required to follow the
- 22 A Presumably he was charged with following the 22Abdel-Hafiz's request not to conduct the consensual 23 orders of Mr. Defenbaugh, Special Agent -- SAC

21 orders of his superiors in that office, was he not?

24Defenbaugh, yes.

- 1 Q Who did you press it with?
- 2 A With the agents in Chicago and in Dallas.
- 3 Q Which agents in Dallas did you press it with?
- A I know I had a conversation with Mr. Patton. 5 I'm trying to remember if I had a conversation or 6 someone in my office or the FBI hierarchy in Chicago
- 7 had a conversation with Mr. Defenbaugh. I know he 8 was in the loop on this. I just don't know exactly
- 9 how -- how it was communicated with him.
- Q Okay. Look at Exhibit No. 42, if you would. 11Do you have that in front of you, Mr. Flessner?
- A I do. I found it.
- O There is a statement contained in that 14 exhibit in the last paragraph. It says, Based upon 15his knowledge of the subject's background in the case 16as well as the location, SA Abdel-Hafiz recommended
- 18Ultimately, the decision was made by management at
- 20decision. The Dallas Special Agent in Charge and
- 21 other supervisors concurred with Special Agent
- 23monitoring.
- Did I read that correctly, sir?

Page 65

- A I believe you did.
- Q Does that comport -- does this particular FBI 2 3 statement comport with your recollection of the 4 events, at least the part that I just read to you?
- A No, it doesn't.
- 6 O Okay.
- 7 A Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz never -- well,
- 8 he -- he did not suggest an alternative plan other
- 9 than doing an overt recording. There was no 10alternative plan involving a covert recording, which 10mistakenly referred to this as a 302, but it's not a 11 was the only acceptable way to do it.
- Q But an overt recording is an alternative 13plan, is it not?
- 14 A No, it wasn't. It wasn't. It was not an 15 alternative plan.
- 16 Q Were you made aware of any of the cases that 16how they labeled them, but that sounds right, 17 Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz was working on in the 18Dallas office?
- 19 A No, I wasn't.
- Q Were you aware of the importance of his 21 gathering intelligence in the Arab community to the 21 22FBI?
- 23 A I was not privy to any of Mr. -- or Special 24 Agent Abdel-Hafiz's cases in Dallas.

O What is a 302?

- 2 A A 302 is a report of investigation. It's on 3 FBI form 302. This is a -- this is -- looks like a 4 internal FBI form reporting within the Bureau.
- Q Okay. If you could, while you've got 41 in 6 your hand, don't lose it, look at Exhibit 11A?
- A Okav.
- Q And this is also not a 302, is that correct?
- A No, this is not. If I -- I may have
- 11302 either.
- 12 Q Okay. These particular exhibits, 41 and 11. 13are what you call ECs. Is that electronic 14communications?
- 15 A Yeah -- well, you know, I don't really know
- MR. KOSKI: Let me interrupt for one second. 17 18Both these documents say at the bottom "subject to 19protective order". Is that a protective order in 20this case?
- MR. KAITCER: Yes, that's a -- and Chip can 22correct me if I'm wrong, but there is a protective 23 order in this case, but it's such that we can use it 24for legitimate usages in the case, and we're not

Page 66

- Q Is it conceivable that Special Agent
- 2 Abdel-Hafiz was working on other matters for the FBI2 of using it in the case.
- 3 such that it would have compromised those particular
- 4 investigations if he were to become involved in
- 5 wearing a wire as y'all call it?
- MR. KOSKI: I'll object to foundation, but the 6 7 witness can answer.
- THE WITNESS: Anything is conceivable. That's 9 not what was communicated to me at the time. 10BY MR. KAITCER:
- 11 Q Okay. Well, look at Exhibit No. 41, if you 12would, please.
- 13 A Sure.
- 14 Q Have you ever -- do you have it in front of 15you?
- A I don't -- I was never given 41. 16
- Q Do you have it in front of you now? 17
- A No, I do not.
- 19 MR. KOSKI: We're looking. Hold on one second.19 restrictions. Exhibit 11 was produced in a more
- (Exhibit No. 41 tendered to the Witness.) 20
- THE WITNESS: Okay. I have 41 in front of me. 22BY MR. KAITCER:
- Q Is this what y'all refer to as a 302?
- A No. this is not a 302.

- 1 supposed to disseminate it outside of the necessity
- MR. KOSKI: But if there's no objection, then
- 4 I'll designate this whole transcript as subject to
- 5 whatever protective obligations exist including that
- 6 order, and if somebody wants to get me a copy and
- 7 then for some reason it should be so not designated,
- 8 we can address that later, but at least for the time
- 9 being let me make that direction.
- 10 MR. KAITCER: Sure. I think -- Chip can correct 11me, but I think these documents were given to us from
- 12the FBI subject to the protective order with the
- 13understanding we would just use them for legitimate
- 14 purposes in this litigation.
- 15 MR. KOSKI: Fair enough.
- 16 MR. BABCOCK: It's -- it's a little more
- 17complicated than that, not much. They -- they gave
- 18us an initial set of documents without any
- 20redacted form than Exhibit 11A is. Then there was a
- 21second production of which 11A was a part of, and you
- 22can tell any document from the second production
- 23because it has at the bottom "subject to protective
- 24 order", and there was an agreed -- what is referred

- 1 to in the order itself as a Privacy Act Order that
- 2 was entered by Judge Lynn with the consent of all the 2
- 3 parties to the litigation. So Mr. Kaitcer is correct
- 4 in that the documents may be freely used for the
- 5 purposes of the litigation, although, not for other 6 purposes.
- 7 MR. KOSKI: Okay. Thank you.
- 8 BY MR. KAITCER:
- O Anyway, with that understanding, if we could 10go back to Exhibit No. 41, Mr. Flessner, you haven't
- 11seen 41 before, is that right?
- 12 A Again, I don't have any recollection of it,
- 13but it's entirely possible that I have seen it. I 14 just don't -- don't recall.
- 15 Q Okay. Are you aware of the significance of 1 6notations on these communications especially where -1 6out how this whole process works.
- 17 with regard to where it says "approved by"?
- 18 A No.
- 19 O Okay. Well, this particular exhibit, Exhibit 2041, indicates that it was drafted by Special Agent
- 21 Abdel-Hafiz and approved by Danny Defenbaugh,
- 22Fernando Candelario, and Ronald Patton. Do you see 22
- 23that on the first page?
- A I see the names, sure.

1 assistance in the Vulgar Betrayal investigation.

Page 71

Page 72

- A Okay. I see. And you see that in the
- 3 "Synopsis" in 41?
- Q It's -- the response is 41.
- 5 A Okav.
- O 11A contains the Chicago request for this 7 consensual monitoring --
- A Okay.
- O -- isn't that right? 9
- 10 A Okay. Yes, apparently, yes.
- O And these are not orders, these are requests, 12isn't that correct?
- 13 A Again, these are -- these are internal FBI 14documents. So you really need to talk to someone 15 within the chain of command of the Bureau to figure
- O So in fact, you mentioned early on that you 18were not an FBI agent, so you don't really know 19whether or not a request is considered an order, do 20you?
- MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form.
  - MR. KAITCER: You can answer.
- THE WITNESS: I don't -- I would have no
- 24 understanding as to how internally the FBI would work

1 in that regard?

2 BY MR. KAITCER:

- Q Okay. You understand what an order is, don't 4 you?
- A I have an understanding of what an order is.
- 6 Q Working as an AUSA, did you have the 7 authority to order Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz to do 8 anything?
- A Well, again, you misunderstand the nature of 10the relationship between the prosecutor's office and 11the Bureau. It was not adversarial, and it was not 12hierarchical. They worked together to pursue a 13common goal, which would be to investigate and 14prosecute crimes. I was not an FBI agent, I was not 15an FBI supervisor, I did not have a pure authority to 16 order anybody in the FBI to do anything.
- Q Okay. 17
- 18 A But I sim- -- I did on every occasion that I 19can ever recall instruct FBI agents to conduct 20certain parts of certain investigations to prove the 21case, and every case that was complied with that I 22have -- to repeat myself, I have no memory of ever 23having an FBI agent refuse a request to pursue an 24 investigative lead.

- Page 70
- O Okay. Do you see there appear to be initials 2 next to their names?
- A Yes.
- O Do you have any idea about what the 5 significance is of those initials?
- A No. I mean, I can guess, but your -- your 7 assumptions are as -- probably as meaningful as mine.
- Q Well, not necessarily because I'm not an AUSA 9 or former one. I'm just asking if you knew what the 10 significance was of initials on the "approved by" 11portion of the document?
- 12 A No, I don't.
- Q Now, this document appears to be a response 14to Chicago's request for the Dallas Division's 15 assistance in the Vulgar Betrayal investigation, is 16that right?
- A I'm just looking at it now, but I see -- I 18 see the conversation referred to, yes.
- 19 Q Okay. And now, the Chicago request, I guess, 20is documented by Exhibit 11A, is that right?
- 21 A I'm not -- I'm not sure. Where do you -- how 22do you -- how do you reference that?
- 23 Q On 11A, the first page where it says 24"Synopsis", it says, To request Dallas Division

4

Page 73

- Q Okay. A request you're talking about, not an 2 order?
- A Well, I mean, it's -- it's the words that you 4 want to use, which are fine. It's just that I think 5 the way you describe it misconstrues the nature of
- Q Well, they're actually not my words, they're 8 the words of some of the defendants in this case.
- 9 Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz has been accused of
- 10 refusing to obey orders to conduct covert recording.
- 11To your knowledge, he wasn't ordered to do anything, 12 was he?
- 13 MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form.
- 14 MR. KAITCER: You can answer.
- 15 THE WITNESS: I was not privy to any
- 16conversation. I don't know what he was ordered to do 17 with -- by whom, by Mr. Defenbaugh or by Mr. Pattor, 17
- 18I don't know.

24Exhibit 41.

19BY MR. KAITCER:

6 the relationship.

20 Q Fair enough. Now, if you would look at 21Exhibit 48 -- no, I'm sorry, I shouldn't jump around 22like that. Let's talk about Exhibit 41 and get that 23out of the way. Turn, if you will, to Page 2 of

Page 75

- 1 intelligence regarding their investigations was not 2 addressed.
- 3 Do you see where it says that?
  - A I see where it says that, yes.
- Q Did anyone make you aware of that particular 6 perspective following the issuance of this electronic 7 communication of April 21st, 1999?
- A I believe I've told you what Special Agent
- 9 Abdel-Hafiz told me as to why he would not
- 10 participate in the recording of the potential
- 11 witnesses or witness, and he did not at any time tell 12me that his ability to -- or I have no memory of him
- 13telling me his ability to gather information, I don't
- 14know what 55 FBI field offices he is talking about, 15 would be hindered by that. I do remember him talking
- 16about safety, though, I remember that.
- Q Well, in any event, this communication 18 appears to have been sent on April the 21st, 1999,
- 19but you were not made aware of it or the Dallas
- 20 office's position that's referenced in this
- 21 communication, were you?
- A I don't remember that, no.
- Q Pardon me? 23
- A I don't remember having a discussion about

Page 74

- 1 A Yes, sir, I'm there.
- Q Okay. If you will read Paragraph 4, it
- 3 recites that, It was also explained that there
- 4 existed a huge potential for Special Agent
- 5 Abdel-Hafiz to lose his ability to gather
- 6 intelligence from the Arab community if it were known
- 7 in the community that he had recorded a conversation
- 8 between himself and another Muslim seeking advice.
- 9 Do you see where it says that?
- 10 A Yeah, I think it says advise, not advice, but 11yes.
- 12 Q Maybe that was a typo, I don't know, seeking 13advice. In any event, were you ever told by anyone
- 14in the Chicago office in response to this electronic
- 15communication dated April 21st, 1999 that this 16explanation was given?
- 17 A I don't recall this explanation ever being 18 given to me.
- 19 Q Okay. And Paragraph 5 says, During the
- 21 agents and AUSAs and Dallas Agent Abdel-Hafiz and his 21 Attorney's Office. I don't know exactly how that
- 20teleconference of April 15th, 1999 between Chicago 22supervisor Ronald Patton, the fact of the potential 23loss of Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz's ability to assist 24the remaining 55 FBI field offices in gathering

- 1 that, no.
- Q Now, if we could, do you have Exhibit 8 --3 I'm sorry, 48 handy, Mr. Flessner?
- A 48?
- 5 O Yes.
- 6 A Have I seen that yet?
- Q That's the transcript of your interview with 7 8 ABC News.
- 9 A Okay. I've got it.
- 10 Q Probably the biggest one there.
- A Yeah, I have it.
- Q If you would look at the page Bates stamped 12 13168?
- 14 A Okay.
- 15 Q You have a discussion there between you and
- 16the interviewer, and you're talking about basically a 17 difference between the criminal investigation portion
- 18 of the work you were doing and the, I guess,
- 19 intelligence arm or the intelligence gathering
- 20 portion of either the FBI or possibly the U.S.
- 22works.
- 23 But my question is: Was there a difference 24between the criminal investigation portion of the

- 1 Bureau and the intelligence gathering portion of 2 the Bureau?
- A Yes, those were two distinct -- I'm thinking 4 of the word divisions, but they had specific names. 5 I can't remember. Groups.
- Q Okay. And so your -- your role and your job 7 was to develop evidence for criminal investigations, 8 right?
- A Yes, but this was a hybrid, a unique 10 investigation. You'll have to remember this is 11pre-Patriot Act and pre-9/11. So the ability -- or 12there was -- there was a mechanism by which 13intelligence information could be thrown over the 14 wall to the criminal investigators, and that's what 15was supposed to be happening in this case internally 16within the Bureau, but it was -- it wasn't as fluid 17as it is now.
- 18 Q Okay. Back then there was a definite, I 19 guess, demarcation between criminal investigations 20and intelligence gathering, right?
- 21 A Oh, there still is.
- 22 Q There still is?
- 23 A Right.
- 24 Q So would it be safe to say that the policy

- 1 intelligence branch or someone in the intelligence 2 branch of the Department of Justice to shut the 3 investigation down?
- MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form. 5 BY MR. KAITCER:
- Q Were you not?
- 7 A That's not accurate.
- Q Okay. Tell me what is accurate, then.
- 9 A What's the question? About what?
- 10 Q How was it not accurate?
- 11 A There was never a decision -- I was never 12told by anyone from the Department of Justice to shut 13the investigation down. That did not happen.
- Q Okay. Do you know who did shut the 15 investigation down?
- 16 A Well, the investigation my understanding 17 is I left the office -- the U.S. Attorney's Office in 18March of 2000. My understanding is the investigation 19 was temporarily closed in the fall of 2000 and was 20 resurrected, and it resulted in indictments of three 21 individuals which are now pending in the United 22States District Court for the Northern District of 23Illinois for Judge Amy St. Eve presently.
- 24 Q Who is the judge?

Page 80

- Page 78 1 considerations that underlie the criminal
- 2 investigation portion would not necessarily be the
- 3 same policy considerations that underlie the 4 intelligence gathering portion?
- MR. KOSKI: I'll object to foundation, but the 6 witness can answer.
- THE WITNESS: I think that's an accurate 8 statement.
- 9 BY MR. KAITCER:
- 10 Q And I'll represent to you, Mr. Flessner, that 11the way I got this information is reading your 12interview just last night, and the -- apparently what 13you were identifying is some problems between one 14branch of either the Bureau or the Department of 15 Justice and another?
- 16 A I'm glad someone understood.
- 17 Q And in looking at that, it appears that you, 18too, were a part of a I don't know if I would 19 initially call it a paramilitary organization, but an 20organization which certainly had its chain of command 20about bureaucracy and why we can't do or why we can't 21and its structure, isn't that right?
- 22 A I think the Department of Justice definitely 23has a chain of command and structure, yes.
- 24 Q Okay. And you were instructed by I guess the

- A Amy St. Eve.
- Q Turn, if you would, to the -- maybe this is a 3 more accurate depiction of what your position is 4 about what happened. If you would turn to Page 200 5 of Exhibit 48. Are you there, Mr. Flessner?
- A I am, I am, I'm sorry. I was just looking at 7 it.
- Q Okay. If you would read the portion that's 9 near -- well, there's a marking, someone went ahead 10 and marked this for us, which is pretty helpful. It 11says 020802. Read that statement that you made to 12the ABC interviewer, if you would?
- 13 A Starting at 020802, is that where you want me 14to begin?
- 15 Q Yes.
- 16 A When it became clear to me that this case was 17not going to be supported by the FBI and the 18department -- and the Justice Department, and I had 19spent probably five -- my 500th hour in a meeting
- 21do that, that just caused me to make a decision,
- 22then, to move on.
- 23 Q Okay. What were you referring to in that 24statement?

- A What happened was that the -- the -- there 2 was internal fighting within the Bureau between the 3 intelligence community and the criminal investigators 4 with respect to how and what information was going to 5 be disclosed to the criminal investigation unit, my 6 team, for purposes of prosecution. And the -- again, 7 this was pre-Patriot Act and pre-9/11, and there was 8 a lot of internal coveting of -- of each his own 9 territory, and that caused a great deal of 10bureaucratic problems with the investigation.
- We, as I've indicated here in the interview, 12we spent many, many, many, many hours trying to work 12 13out those bureaucratic problems, and I felt like that 14never became resolved, and I felt like the 15 investigation was not going to move forward in my
- 17decisions with my life. 18 Q And look at Page 191, if you would?

1 6 lifetime as a prosecutor, and so I made my own

- 19 A Sure.
- 20 Q Let me know when you're there.
- 21 A I am there.
- 22 Q If you look at the line that begins at 23012717, read that sort of cluster of information that 24you gave the ABC interviewer?

Page 82

- A And every time we asked for the smallest 2 thing it became a huge issue. It went -- it went 3 clear up to the, you know, the highest levels of the 4 Chicago FBI office, then to the FBI in Washington, 6 can't do that.
- Q Thank you, Mr. Flessner.
- Is this also sort of part and parcel of the 9 problems you were describing earlier about the 10 investigation, criminal investigation portion versus 11the intelligence gathering portion of the Bureau and 12the Department of Justice?
- 13 A Yes. 14 Q Okay. And when the answer came back down 15 from wherever it came back down, as you're referring 16to in this particular segment, you were expected to 17 follow the directions in that answer, were you not? 18 A Well, certain things within the department 19had to be approved. For example, I couldn't go out 20 and get a Title 3 without getting permission from the 21Department of Justice and getting approval of court. 22Sounds like that's no longer the case these days, but 23there was a time when -- when all those things were 24tightly regulated. So those things were -- I had to

Page 83

1 seek approval from main justice, yes.

- Q And if you didn't get that approval from the 3 people above you, you weren't allowed to do the thing 4 you wanted to do, isn't that right?
- 5 A Well, yeah, I mean, there were -- some things 6 a Line AUSA would have authority to some types of 7 investigative tools, a Line AUSA would have authority 8 to initiate on his own. Others required DOJ 9 approval, others required court approval.
- 10 Q Now, you're not a -- you're not in the FBI, 11as you said, you were never an FBI agent, right?
- A I think we've established that, sir.
- 13 Q Were you -- are you familiar with the rules 14 and regulations in the FBI for agents?
- A Barely. I would have no reason --
- 16 Q Pardon me?
- 17 A Barely. I would have -- other than 18anecdotally or just discussions with people, I would 19have no real understanding of that.
- 20 Q You have no personal knowledge or any real 21 understanding of the rules and regulations that 22govern FBI agents, right?
- 23 A Well, again, I worked with FBI agents on a 24daily basis for almost 13 years, and I still have

- 1 friends that I see, but I never had cause to sit down 2 and read the policies and regulations of the Bureau 3 except in a case in which there was a problem, and I 4 did in this case have to get some familiarity with 5 and the answer was -- always came back down, no, you 5 it, but I would not in any way say I'm familiar with 6 that -- with those procedures.
  - Q Well, turn to Page 189 of Exhibit 48, please.
  - 8 A Okay.
  - Q The last statement, full statement on there 10says I -- and this is your statement to the ABC 11interviewer. It says, I am troubled by an agent who 12 disobeys the rules and regulations in -- for a 13personal belief.
  - Is that what it says there?
  - 15 A Yes.
  - 16 Q Is that what you told the ABC interviewer?
  - 17 A Yes. If this is an accurate transcript, 18that's what I said.
  - Q You have no personal knowledge of any rules 20and regulations that Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz 21disobeyed, do you?
  - A I don't think that's accurate, sir.
  - Q All right. Then tell me what rule of 24that Special -- what rule of the FBI did Special

1 Agent Abdel-Hafiz disobey?

2 A Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz said to me and my 3 colleagues that he -- it was against his religion for

4 a Muslim to record a Muslim. And it is my

5 understanding, and it certainly was made clear to me

6 when I became a member of the Department of Justice,

7 that my personal beliefs were not to interfere with

8 my duties, which was to uphold the laws and the

9 Constitution of the United States. So his religious

10belief that it was -- that he was not to record a

11Muslim was not relevant to the investigation.

This was a very important key part to a very

13large, in fact, at the time I believe it was the 14 largest money laundering terrorist investigation in

15the country, and he refused to cooperate in that, for

1 6 religious beliefs is what he said to us, and that to 17me is a disobeying of the rules and regulations of

18this office.

19 Q I'm going to ask you again, Mr. Flessner,

20 what rule and regulation of conduct of FBI special 21agents did he disobey?

22 MR. KOSKI: I'll object. That's been asked and 23answered.

24 MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form. I'll join that

Page 87

MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form.

THE WITNESS: Again, I was never told that. I 3 told you what I was told as to why it wasn't going to

4 be done.

5 BY MR. KAITCER:

Q If you would turn to Page 183 of Exhibit 48, 7 if you look at the bottom of 183, top of 184?

A Okay.

9 O You make the comment, In my experience in

10more than 12 years I've never known an agent to say I

11 will not participate in this investigation.

A That's correct.

O Okay. That's not an accurate statement, is 13

14it?

15 A I believe it is. Do you have some

16information that I'm not aware of?

Q Well, Special Agent -- Special Agent

18 Abdel-Hafiz said he would not participate. He said

19he would be happy to either talk to the -- this

20 suspect or this particular person of interest or that

21he would advise that person that he or she was being

22recorded and do it in that fashion. So he didn't

23refuse to participate, did he, he just didn't do

24 exactly what you wanted him to do --

Page 86

Page 88

1 objection.

2 BY MR. KAITCER:

3 Q You're refusing to answer that question?

A I think I've already answered that, sir. I

5 don't know how to say it better than I've already 6 said it.

Q Let me ask you this question: If the

8 decision had been made to do the recording, as you

9 have requested, would Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz have 9 testify to that interview later if necessary?

10needed his Agent in Charge's signature to approve the 10 A That's not a meaningful participation in

11recording?

12 MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form.

13 MR. KAITCER: You can answer.

14 THE WITNESS: I do not know all of the niceties

15of what forms need to be signed.

16BY MR. KAITCER:

17 Q Do you know if there is a -- an FBI rule or 18 regulation that requires a Special Agent in Charge to 19approve of any covert reporting?

20 A It sounds right, but I do not know as I sit 21here.

22 Q And are you aware that Special Agent in

23Charge Danny Defenbaugh specifically ordered him no23practice in a deposition, we need to have both 24to make such a recording?

MR. BABCOCK: Object to the form. 2 BY MR. KAITCER:

3 Q -- isn't that right?

MR. BABCOCK: Same objection.

THE WITNESS: No, that's not right, sir.

6 BY MR. KAITCER:

Q Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz didn't say that he 8 would be happy to interview the person and then

11the -- in the investigation. As I've explained to --

12 O Let me ask you this question, then. Did

13Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz tell you he would be happy

14to interview this particular individual and testify

15about it later if need be?

16 A Again, that's not where the investigation was 17headed.

18 Q Did he --

19 MR. KOSKI: Mr. Kaitcer, Mr. Kaitcer, I'm sorry.

20That's at least twice now you've interrupted the

21 witness, and I think particularly because we're doing

22this telephonically, and also, just because it's good

24 parties finish their statements before we, you know,

1 next interrupt each other.

- MR. KAITCER: All right. I'll try to do better. 3 BY MR. KAITCER:
- Q I think the question, Mr. Flessner can be 5 answered yes or no. Did Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz 6 tell you that he would interview this particular 7 individual and testify about it later if need be?
- MR. KOSKI: And I'll object to that as asked and 9 answered, but the witness can respond.
- THE WITNESS: Again, I can't answer that yes or 11no, and the reason I can't answer it yes or no is for 12every thing that I've already said.
- I was not interested in Special Agent 14 Abdel-Hafiz's opinions about what my investigation -14 told us that the individual had approached him. The 15where my investigation should go or how it should be 15 individual was already on our radar screen. 16conducted. That offer -- if I may just finish.
- MR. KAITCER: Sure. Go ahead.
- THE WITNESS: That offer -- I don't remember 19 exactly what he said about that, but that offer, if 20that offer was made, was not a meaningful offer. It 21 would not have assisted us in any meaningful way, 22because it only would have allowed the potential 23 grand jury witness, if you will, that's what I'm

24 going to identify them as, as giving them information

Page 91

- Q This individual, either you or Special Agent 2 Wright or Special Agent Vincent, didn't just pick up 3 the phone and call up Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz and 4 say, hey, we have this guy we want you to talk to?
- O That's not how it went, was it?
- 7 A No. He was contacted by the -- by the 8 potential witness, and he informed us that he had 9 been contacted. That, of course, was his obligation 10as an FBI agent to communicate that information.
- Q And he brought this information to your 12attention?
- A Well, no, he did not, sir. What he did is he
- 16 Q Okay. Let me talk to you, if you look at 17Page -- back to Exhibit No. 48, if you will look at 18the page that is Bates stamped 173.
- A I am there.

A No. no.

Q Now, I'm trying to get a brief picture of 21 what the discussion is here. The interviewer asked 22you if -- what you were doing, you were on a -- sort 23 of a money trail and a money laundering trail, right, 24 you weren't necessarily doing counterterrorism, is

Page 90

1 which I did not want them -- I could not allow them

- 2 to have to continue to conduct an undercover 3 investigation.
- 4 BY MR. KAITCER:
- Q In fact, far from not wanting to participate 6 in the investigation, wasn't it Special Agent 7 Abdel-Hafiz who brought this individual up on your 8 radar screen to begin with?
- A No, that's not true.
- 10 Q It is not?
- A It is not true. What happened is he did, I
- 13communication that this individual had approached 14him, and the individual's name I believe was in the
- 15system under Vulgar Betrayal, and that's how the 16 whole issue arose as to, yes, we're now going to
- 17 pursue this covert investigation, but he did not 18bring -- initially bring the individual on our radar 19screen.
- Q Okay. Well, you didn't know about this 21 particular person and then contact Special Agent 22Abdel-Hafiz about trying to talk to him, did you?
- 23 A I'm sorry, could you repeat that? I didn't 24know what? I didn't hear that.

- 1 that a fair characterization?
- A I'm -- your -- I'm not sure what your 3 question is. Are you referring me to something in 4 the transcript, or are you asking me a separate 5 question?
- Q I'm referring right now to a separate 7 question than this is what you're talking about in 8 terms of the transcript here?
- A If -- I haven't read this page, but if the 10 question is what was the nature of the investigation, 11the nature of the investigation was that there was 12believe, inform Agent Wright through some electronic 22individuals and institutions both within and out the 13United States who were raising and laundering money 14 that was ultimately being used in the support of 15terrorism mostly but not exclusively to disrupt the
  - 16Middle East peace process and in support of Hamas. Q Right. And the interviewer -- understanding 18that, the interviewer says, Any opportunities to
  - 19trace the money prior to 9/11 that might have made a 20 difference -- I'm sorry, that might have made some 21 difference. What was your response?
  - 22 A Do you want me to read what I said, or do 23you want me to --
  - 24 Q Please.

7 interview.

- A What's your question?
- O Go ahead and read what your response was to 2 3 that question.
- A Okay.
- Q That's on Page 173. 5
- A Thank you.
- 7 I don't think so. I mean, it's very -

8 everyone wants to speculate about, you know, how 9 could we have -- what could we have done or what 10should have been -- or what could have been done. 11It's impossible to know had the investigation gone 12 forward, you know, how far it could have ultimately 13touched people, but I have no reason to believe that 14ultimately it would have impacted 9/11 one way or the 4 15other.

- 16 Q And when you say, It would have ultimately 17impacted 9/11 one way or the other, "it" was the 18 investigation that you were doing?
- 19 A Yes. I think my answer is, what I'm saying 20here is, I'm -- certainly was not in a position, I 21don't remain in a position to hope that I could have 22prevented by this investigation 9/11.
- 23 MR. KAITCER: Right. And -- let me take a quick23 24break here. I may be done here in a just a minute,

Page 93

1 A I'm not saying one way or the other. I mean, 2 I don't know. I can't -- I think it is presumptuous 3 and naive to suspect that my investigation, our 4 investigation, the Bureau's investigation would stop 5 9/11. I'm not in any way suggesting that. I mean, 6 that shouldn't be, you know, taken away from this

- MR. KAITCER: Okay. Thank you. Let me just 9 check my notes and see if there is anything else I 10need to go over with you.
- 11 MR. KOSKI: While you're looking, the 12videographer informs me we have approximately five 13minutes left on this videotape.
- MR. KAITCER: Okay. I may be -- I don't know if 15 you want to change now. I don't have five minutes of 16 questions left. I don't know if Chip does or not.
- 17 MR. BABCOCK: Not unless you ask a doozy.
- MR. KAITCER: I don't think it's going to be a 19doozy. I always wish I had one, but there's usually 20not.
- THE WITNESS: I bet I could talk for five 22minutes. You want me to try?
- MR. KAITCER: You're a trial lawyer, right?
  - 24 THE WITNESS: That's right.

Page 94

Page 96

- 1 Mr. Flessner. I'm going to run down to the little 2 lawyer's room.
- 3 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We're going off the record at 4 3:05.
- 5 (Recess was taken.)
- THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going back on the 7 record at 3:09.
- 8 BY MR. KAITCER:
- 9 Q Mr. Flessner, if you would turn to Page 175 10of Exhibit 48?
- 11 A Okay.
- 12 Q There's on the previous page, on 174, there's 13a discussion of the 15 of 19 hijackers being Saudi, 14 and they had money, and there was cash flow, and they 15had bank accounts, and there were wire transfers, et 16cetera. Do you see where all that discussion is on 17Page 174?
- 18 A Yes.
- 19 Q Now, 175, the interviewer asks you, That's 20 what you were investigating, people like that, those 2119 hijackers prior to 9/11, right? What was your 22response to that, at least down to line 011321?
- 23 A Again, you want me to read it, Mr. Kaitcer?
- 24 Q Please.

- 1 MR. KAITCER: Shouldn't be a problem.
- 2 Okay. Just a couple of quick questions, and 3 then we'll see if we need to change it.
- 4 BY MR. KAITCER:
- Q When you were on Mr. O'Reilly's show, and I 6 believe that the transcript of that is - let me see 7 if I can find that transcript where you were 8 testifying.
- MR. KOSKI: 49.
- 10BY MR. KAITCER:
- Q 49. If you would look at the portion that is 12Bates stamped 105, are you there Mr. Flessner?
- 13 A I am.
- Q Mr. O'Reilly asks you a question, Bottom 15line, though, and your response was, Bottom line, is 16he said, I would not record another Muslim. That is 17 against my religion.
- That is what you said on the radio -- I'm 19 sorry, on the television program, is that correct?
- 20 A If that's -- if the transcript is accurate,
- 21 yes.
- 22 Q Do you have a present recollection that 23that's Special Agent Abdel-Hafiz's words verbatim, or 24is that just your interpretation of them?

Page 97	Page 99
1 A I don't have a verbatim recollection of it	1 CHANGES AND SIGNATURE
2 now.	2 PAGE LINE CHANGE REASON
3 Q Okay. So	3
4 A I do have a verbatim I know he said a	4
5 Muslim does not record another Muslim. I remember	5
	6
6 that specific sentence.	
7 Q Do you remember I'm sorry. I didn't mean	78
8 to cut you off. Did you have any more you wanted to	
9 add to that?	9
10 A In the general I don't know if it was	
11 invocation or the general communication was that that	11
12 was against his religion. Whether or not he said	12
13that exact phrase precisely as it is recounted here,	13
14I do not recall that.	14
15 Q Okay. Do you remember verbatim the statement	15
16"that is against my religion"?	16
17 A Again, what I just said was that that	17
18 information was communicated somehow. I do not have	18
19the specific recollection he used those five words.	19
20 Q Okay. And the last question I need to ask	20
21you is, during that particular telephone conference,	21
22did Special Agents Vincent and Wright participate	22
23 with you in that conference?	23
24 A They were not they were present in the	24
Page 98	Page 100
1 room. They did not I have no recollection of them	1
2 speaking during the conversation.	2
3 Q Did they tell you to try to get Special Agent	3
4 Abdel-Hafiz to say something or to did they say	4
5 something like, Push him, make him say it? Did they	5 I, MARK FLESSNER, have read the foregoing
6 say anything like that?	
	6 deposition and hereby affix my signature that same is
7 A No, no, sir, that did not happen. That	7 true and correct, except as noted above.
7 A No, no, sir, that did not happen. That 8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would	7 true and correct, except as noted above.
<del>-</del> -	7 true and correct, except as noted above. 8
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened.	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened. 10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS )
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened.  10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner.	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 13COUNTY OF )
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened. 10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11 time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner. 12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome.	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 13COUNTY OF
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened. 10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner. 12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome. 13 MR. BABCOCK: No further questions.	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 13COUNTY OF
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened. 10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner. 12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome. 13 MR. BABCOCK: No further questions. 14 MR. KAITCER: What about Mr. Hutton?	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 13COUNTY OF
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened. 10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner. 12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome. 13 MR. BABCOCK: No further questions. 14 MR. KAITCER: What about Mr. Hutton? 15 MR. HUTTON: I'm over and out.	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 13COUNTY OF
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened. 10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner. 12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome. 13 MR. BABCOCK: No further questions. 14 MR. KAITCER: What about Mr. Hutton? 15 MR. HUTTON: I'm over and out. 16 MR. KAITCER: Okay.	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 13COUNTY OF
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened. 10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner. 12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome. 13 MR. BABCOCK: No further questions. 14 MR. KAITCER: What about Mr. Hutton? 15 MR. HUTTON: I'm over and out. 16 MR. KAITCER: Okay. 17 MR. KOSKI: We will reserve our right to read and	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 13COUNTY OF
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened. 10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner. 12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome. 13 MR. BABCOCK: No further questions. 14 MR. KAITCER: What about Mr. Hutton? 15 MR. HUTTON: I'm over and out. 16 MR. KAITCER: Okay. 17 MR. KOSKI: We will reserve our right to read and 18sign the transcript, and I guess that we're off the	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 13COUNTY OF
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened.  10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner.  12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome.  13 MR. BABCOCK: No further questions.  14 MR. KAITCER: What about Mr. Hutton?  15 MR. HUTTON: I'm over and out.  16 MR. KAITCER: Okay.  17 MR. KOSKI: We will reserve our right to read and 18 sign the transcript, and I guess that we're off the 19 record.	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10 MARK FLESSNER 11 12THE STATE OF ILLINOIS ) 13COUNTY OF
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened. 10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner. 12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome. 13 MR. BABCOCK: No further questions. 14 MR. KAITCER: What about Mr. Hutton? 15 MR. HUTTON: I'm over and out. 16 MR. KAITCER: Okay. 17 MR. KOSKI: We will reserve our right to read and 18 sign the transcript, and I guess that we're off the 19 record. 20 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This marks the end of Tape	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10
8 that would not have been appropriate, and that would 9 never have happened.  10 MR. KAITCER: I have no further questions at this 11time. Thank you, Mr. Flessner.  12 THE WITNESS: You're welcome.  13 MR. BABCOCK: No further questions.  14 MR. KAITCER: What about Mr. Hutton?  15 MR. HUTTON: I'm over and out.  16 MR. KAITCER: Okay.  17 MR. KOSKI: We will reserve our right to read and 18sign the transcript, and I guess that we're off the 19record.  20 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: This marks the end of Tape 21No. 1 and concludes the deposition of Mark Flessner.	7 true and correct, except as noted above.  8 9 10

Page 101	Page 103
1 NO. CC 096 204518 04 GAMAL ABDEL-HAFIZ, ) IN THE DISTRICT COURT  2 ) vs. ) 3 ) FOX ENTERTAINMENT GROUP, ) TARRANT COUNTY, TEXAS 4 INC., FOX BROADCASTING ) COMPANY, FOX NEWS, INC., FOX) 5 NEWS NETWORK, INC., FOX NEWS) NETWORK, L.L.C., FOX NEWS ) 6 HOLDINGS, INC., AND BILL ) O'REILLY, ) 96th JUDICIAL DISTRICT  7 8 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATION 9 DEPOSITION OF MARK FLESSNER February 21st, 2006  10 11 I, NICOLE M. DEBARTOLO, Certified Shorthand 12Reporter in and for the State of Texas, hereby 13certify to the following: 14 That the witness, MARK FLESSNER, was duly sworn 15by the officer and that the transcript of the oral 16deposition is a true record of the testimony given by 17the witness; 18 That the deposition transcript was submitted on 19	1 FURTHER CERTIFICATION UNDER RULE 203 TRCP 2 The original deposition [was / was not] returned 3 to the deposition officer on
Page 102  1 Mr. Babcock - 53 MINUTES 2 Mr. Kaitcer - 1 HOUR: 4 MINUTES 3 That pursuant to information given to the 4 deposition officer at the time said testimony was 5 taken, the following includes counsel for all parties 6 of record: 7 Mr. Kaitcer, ATTORNEY FOR PLAINTIFF 8 Mr. Babcock, ATTORNEY FOR DEFENDANTS 9 I further certify that I am neither 10counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the 11parties or attorneys in the action in which this 12proceeding was taken, and further that I am not 13 financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of 14 the action. 15 Further certification requirements 16 pursuant to Rule 203 of TRCP will be certified to 17 after they have occurred. 18 Certified to by me this day of 19, 200 20 21 22	